Peabody Museum of Natural History Yale University New Haven, CT 06520

Postilla Number 175 2 May 1979

Diversification and Biogeography of the One-Toed Horses **Onohippidium and Hippidion**

Bruce J. MacFadden Morris F. Skinner

Received 14 June 1977

Abstract

In this report we describe a large sample of Onohippidium galushai, new species, from the Late Hemphillian (Early Pliocene) of western Arizona, one ramus of Hippidion sp. from the Early Hemphillian (Late Miocene) of the Texas High Plains, and one ramus of cf. Hippidion sp. from the Irvingtonian (Late Pliocene to Early Pleistocene) of southern California. These one-toed horses were previously thought to have been confined to Plio-Pleistocene deposits of South America. Onohippidium from Arizona possesses a retracted nasal notch, deep preorbital facial fossae, and dental pattern diagnostic of South American representatives of this genus. Hippidion from Texas and California exhibit the dental characters, especially in the deep ectoflexids, seen in South American representatives of this genus. This is the first report of these horses from North America. The presence of Onohippidium and Hippidion in North America demonstrates that diversification of these "endemics" occurred prior to dispersal to South America during the Pleistocene great faunal interchange.

Introduction

ARVASD

LIBRARY

J.J. C. Martin C. C.

One of the most interesting groups of fossil horses is known from Plio-Pleistocene deposits of South America. These horses, which include Hippidion, Onohippidium, and Parahipparion, are, so far as is known, characterized by unusual morphological adaptations. Both Hippidion and Onohippidium have retracted nasal notches (Fig. 1). Along with this retraction, the nasal bones remain elongate and unreduced "splints." Some other mammals, such as tapirs, have retracted nasal regions; which is an adaptation to the presence of a proboscis. Retracted nasals

have bed



Copyright 1979 by the Peabody Museum of Natural History, Yale University. All rights reserved. No part of this publication, except brief quotations for scholarly purposes, may be reproduced without the written permission of the Director, Peabody Museum of Natural History.

Fig. 1.

в

Skulls of Hippidion (A) and Onohippidium (B) showing characters discussed in text (adapted from Burmeister, 1875, and Sefve, 1912, respectively). The nasal splints in the Onohippidium specimen are broken anteriorly. Not to scale.

2

Postilla 175



have been well supported by a nasal septum of cartilage and other tissues. . . ." It seems that this type of nasal modification is related to olfaction, but a more specific function is not certain.

It is generally stated that *Onohippidium* and *Hippidion* were derived from a group of one-toed horses from North America (e.g., Matthew, 1924; Stirton, 1940). The purpose of this report is to describe the first-known record of these two genera in Hemphillian and Irvingtonian deposits of North America and to discuss their biogeographic significance.



Fig. 2.

Left upper (A) and left lower (B) cheek teeth of a one-toed horse showing characters discussed in text. Nomenclature follows Stirton (1941), Skinner and Taylor (1967), and Skinner (MS).



Fig. 3.

Fossil localities discussed in this report. *1*. Undescribed local fauna, unnamed rocks of the Ogallala Group, Early Hemphillian (Late Miocene) of the Texas Panhandle. *2*. Wikieup local fauna (I.f.), Big Sandy Formation, Late Hemphillian (Early Pliocene) of western Arizona. *3*. Sediments probably equivalent in age to the Vallecito Creek I.f., Irvingtonian (Late Pliocene-Early Pleistocene) of the Anza-Borrego State Park of southern California.

are rare in fossil horses, although this feature has been described for certain "Hipparion" from Eurasia which apparently possessed a tapir-like proboscis during life (e.g., Sefve, 1927; Forstén, 1968; Sondaar, 1971). The only other reported occurrence of nasal modification in horses is in Onohippidium and Hippidion. The type of nasal modification seen in these two genera has not been observed in other horses. It is possible that these horses did not possess a proboscis because: 1) The nasal bones are not posteriorly retracted as seen in other mammals with a proboscis; 2) The elongate nasal splints would have restricted movement of soft anatomical structures. Simpson (1951, p. 147-148) states that: "The nasal bones [in Hippidion] . . . must

Abbreviations

The following institutions are referred to in the text:

F:AM Frick: American Mammals, Department of Vertebrate Paleontology, The American Museum of Natural History LACM Section of Vertebrate Paleontology, Los Angeles County Museum of Natural History



One-toed Horses

3

Postilla 175

All measurements of specimens are in millimeters and are abbreviated as follows: A-P Greatest anterior-posterior length Greatest transverse width (labial-lingual; externalinternal) R Right side of tooth row Left side of tooth row (a) Measurement approximate

The dental nomenclature used in this paper and illustrated in Figure 2 follows Stirton (1941), Skinner and Taylor (1967), and Skinner (MS).



Systematic Paleontology

Class Mammalia Linnaeus, 1758 Order Perissodactyla Owen, 1848 Family Equidae Gray, 1821 Genus Onohippidium Moreno, 1891

Revised Distribution. Early Pliocene (Late Hemphillian) of Arizona and Late Pliocene and Pleistocene of South America (Sefve, 1912; Hoffstetter, 1952; Webb, 1976; this report).

Generic Diagnosis. Horse with nasal notch

Fig. 4.

Onohippidium galushai, new species, from the Late Hemphillian of Arizona. A. F:AM 100077, holotype. left lateral view of partial skull. B. F:AM 100077, holotype, left upper dentition. C. F:AM 100078, right lower dentition, reversed.

Pliohippus sp., Lindsay and Tessman, 1974, p.6. Holotype. F:AM 100077, partial skull with well-preserved dentition. Hypodigm. Hundreds of specimens, which consist of skulls, jaws, dentitions, and postcranials in the F:AM collection. There are specimens possibly referable to this species in other institutions, such as the small collections from the same locality at the University of Arizona Laboratory of Paleontology, but these were not examined during the present research. Locality and Age. Frick field crews collected the F:AM specimens during the 1950s from the Big Sandy Formation of Mohave County, Arizona (Fig. 3). This formation, which consists of lacustrine clay to marginal sand facies deposited in an enclosed basin, outcrops along the Big Sandy River from approximately 8.5 km north to 12 km south of the town of Wikieup. Sheppard and Gude (1972) present a detailed stratigraphic description of this formation. Frick field crews collected a few specimens from washes north of Wikieup, but the bulk was collected from a locality approx-

that lies as far anterior as P3_P4 and as far posterior as the orbit. Nasal bones not retracted and remain elongate splints. Welldeveloped dorsal lacrimal fossa and no ventral malar fossa. Incisors with cement-filled cups (infidibula). Protocone oval to rounded with weak preprotoconal groove and welldeveloped postprotoconal valley. Lower cheek teeth with either shallow ectoflexids (externomedial valleys) and isthmuses in the permanent premolars or deep ectoflexids in the deciduous premolars and molars. Very simple enamel plications. Monodactyl metapodials.

Onohippidium galushai, new species Fig. 4.



4

Postilla 175

imately 12 km south of Wikieup, near the southern outcrop margin. This locality is included in Sheppard and Gude's (1972, p. 6) reference section R-3 located ". . . along a wash that parallels Signal Road about 2,600 ft northwest of the road, from NW1/4NW1/4SW1/4 sec. 29 to NE1/4 SE1/4 NW1/4 sec. 29, T. 15 N., R. 12 W., Greenwood Peak quad." The fossilbearing zone is located in the upper part of reference section R-3 (Sheppard and Gude, 1972; Galusha, MS). Galusha (MS) terms this zone the "Clay Bank Quarry locality," which is used in a broad sense to include fossils collected locally within this zone. One large concentration within this locality is approximately 125 m west of Clay Bank Quarry and is termed "Bird Bone Quarry." This fossil-bearing locality and zone can be relocated with the use of Frick field notes (Galusha, MS), Sheppard and Gude (1972), and the U.S. Geological Survey 71/2' Greenwood Peak quad. During the falls of 1976 and 1977 MacFadden and Dr. Noye M. Johnson (Dartmouth College) relocated the Clay Bank Quarry locality and collected samples for paleomagnetic and fission-track analysis.

Description. The nasal notch is retracted posteriorly to a position which lies over P³_P⁴ and is intermediate between the conditions seen in North American *Pliohippus* and *Dinohippus* and in South American *Hippidion* and *Onohippidium*

There is a well-developed complex of fossae on the cheek. The buccinator fossa is anteriormost and in front of the cheek-tooth row. Posterodorsal to the buccinator fossa there is a faint preorbital depression; this is better developed in South American Onohippidium. Posterior to this faint preorbital depression there is a deep and well-defined lacrimal fossa that is also seen in South American Onohippidium. The infraorbital foramen lies above P⁴–M¹.

The mammalian assemblage from the Big Sandy Formation is informally termed the Wikieup local fauna (I.f.) in Tedford et al. (in press). A preliminary faunal list for specimens collected by the University of Arizona field crews is presented by Lindsay and Tessman (1974). The Wikieup I.f. is largely undescribed although some comparisons with assemblages of similar age have been made (e.g., MacFadden, 1977; Tedford et al., in press). Tedford et al. (in press) consider the age of the Wikieup I.f. to be Late Hemphillian (Early Pliocene), which corresponds to an absolute time interval of approximately 4 to 5 million years ago.

The upper dentition of O. galushai is very similar to South American Onohippidium. The incisors have cement-filled cups. P1 is reduced in size. The premolars are larger in cross section than the molars. The protocone is rounded to oval with a weak preprotoconal groove and a deep postprotoconal valley. Occasionally, especially in the molars, the protocone unites with the metaloph and hypocone forming a cement-filled enclosure. The hypocone is oval and usually slightly smaller than the protocone and there is a distinct posterolateral hypoconal groove. The pre- and postfossettes (lakes) are cresentshaped. The plications on the fossettes are absent except for the posterior border of the prefossette and anterior border of the postfossette.

Etymology. Named in honor of members of the Frick Laboratory, Theodore and Marian Galusha.

Specific Diagnosis. Same as for genus with the following distinctions: Nasal notch retracted to above P³_P⁴. Fossa between buccinator and lacrimal fossae not as well developed as other *Onohippidium* (Fig. 4). The lower incisors have cement-filled cups. The P1 and its alveolus are absent, which is characteristic of advanced horses. The premolars are usually larger than the molars. The deciduous premolars show relatively deep ectoflexids, between the protoconid and hypoconid; however, these ectoflexids are not deep enough to divide the isthmus that connects the metaconid and metastylid to the protoconid and hypoconid, respectively. The permanent premolars have relatively shallow ectoflexids that do not divide the isthmus. The



enamel pattern is simple with few secondary plications.

Discussion. The retracted nasal notch with unreduced nasal splints, configuration of preorbital fossae, and, to a lesser extent, simple dental pattern provide convincing evidence for relating *O. galushai* to the South American representatives of this genus. So far as is known, *Onohippidium* has not been identified elsewhere in North America. Other contemporaneous horses for which skulls are known, i.e., *Pliohippus* and *Dinohippus*, have characters different from those seen in *Onohippidium*. *Pliohippus* has a different configuration of preorbital fossae and no retracted nasal notch, whereas *Dinohippus* has a simple preorbital area and no retracted nasal notch. There are numerous forms of the Pliohippus-Dinohippus complex for which the preorbital and nasal areas are not known. Therefore, it would be most satisfying if the Pliohippus-Dinohippus complex could be differentiated from North American Onohippidium solely on the basis of dentition. If this dental differentiation were possible, then Onohippidium might be identified at other Late Hemphillian North American localities. However, the dentitions of these contemporaneous forms are so similar, and there is so much variation within "populations," that generic differentiation on this basis is virtually impossible.

> 30 20 30 40 50 80 TO 60 100 MILLIMETERS

Fig. 5.

Occlusal and lateral photographs of symphysis and left ramus of *Hippidion* sp., F:AM 101439, from the Early Hemphillian of the Texas High Plains.

Genus Hippidion Owen, 1869

Revised Distribution. Early Hemphillian (Late Miocene) of Texas, Irvingtonian (Late Pliocene to Early Pleistocene) of California, and Late Pliocene to Pleistocene of South America (Sefve, 1912; Hoffstetter, 1952; Webb, 1976; this report). **Generic Diagnosis.** Horses with nasal notch that lies above M¹–M². Nasal bones not retracted and they remain elongate splints. Dorsal lacrimal and ventral malar fossae absent. Incisors with cement-filled cups. Protocone oval with weak preprotoconal groove and well-developed postprotoconal valley. Lower cheek teeth with deep ectoflexids in the pre-



6

Postilla 175

molars and molars. Enamel plications usually more complex than in Onohippidium. Monodactyl metapodials. For diagnostic characters not represented in specimens discussed in the present report, see Burmeister (1875), Sefve (1912), and Hoffstetter (1952).

Hippidion sp. Figs. 5, 6, Table 1.

and hypoconid are exteriorly convex. The ectoflexid is relatively deep in the cheek teeth of F:AM 101439; this character is also seen in other Hippidion such as those described by Burmeister (1875), Sefve (1912), and Hoffstetter (1952). When the ectoflexid is very deep it subdivides the isthmus into the antroisthmus and postisthmus (Skinner, MS). The metaconids and metastylids are rounded and subequal in size for a given tooth. There is variation in the metaconid-metastylid complex within the tooth row.

Referred Specimen. F: AM 101439, left ramus and symphysis with RI3-I1, LI1-M3. Locality and Age. The Frick field crew of 1941 collected this specimen from unnamed rocks of the Ogallala Group, 10 miles north of Higgins, Lipscomb County, Panhandle of Texas (Tedford, personal communication, 1976; see Fig. 3). The fauna from this locality is undescribed, but it is similar in age to the Arnett I.f. from adjacent Oklahoma described by Kitts (1957). It is stratigraphically below the Higgins I.f. described by Hesse (1940). Tedford et al. (in press) consider the age of this locality to be Early Hemphillian (Late Miocene). Description. I, and I, have cement-filled cups exposed at the occlusal surface (Fig. 5). I, has cups recessed below the occlusal surface. There is no precanine diastema and C is closely appressed to I₃. Sexual dimorphism is pronounced in fossil horse populations and the small canine size in F:AM 101439 indicates that this individual is a female. Posterior to the symphysial dentition the ramus is laterally constricted for the length of the postcanine diastema, which measures 69.6 mm from the posterior base of C to the anterior base of P2. The mental foramen is approximately midway between C and P2. The P1 and its alveolus are absent. The molars are narrower transversely than the premolars. The dental pattern of F:AM 101439 (Fig. 6) is similar to that of Hippidion illustrated by Burmeister (1875). P2 is triangular-shaped and similar in dental pattern to the rest of the molars except for the addition of the anteriormost conid, which is characteristic of the P2 in horses, whereas P3 through M3 have an anterointernal paralophid. The protoconid



Fig. 6.

Occlusal view of Hippidion sp., F:AM 101439, showing details of dental pattern (see Fig. 5).

In P₂-P₄ and M₂-M₃ the metaconid is joined to the protolophid by a constricted antroisthmus and the metastylid is joined to the hypoconid by the postisthmus. In M1 the isthmus is not as constricted as in the other teeth and the metaconid-metastylid complex is smaller and more poorly defined than the other molars. This variation in dental pattern of M₁ is probably a result of differential tooth wear. In the premolars, the hypoconid and entoconid are separated by a constriction. These same parts are less distinct in the molars. In the M₃, posterior to the hypoconulid, there is an isolated conid that is also seen in other Hippidion. This conid connects to the hypoconulid during later stages of wear. F:AM 101439 is similar in size to the smaller South American Hippidion species. For dental and size differences, Figures 4 and 5, and Table 1 should be compared to the illustrations and measurements of Burmeister (1875), Sefve (1912), and Hoffstetter (1952). Discussion. The dental characters of F:AM 101439, especially in the diagnostic deep ectoflexids in both premolars and molars, present a convincing argument for its assignment

One-toed Horses

Postilla 175

to *Hippidion*. The specific identification of the Texas *Hippidion* is best deferred to a study that incorporates other relevant specimens. The significance of this specimen with respect to the biogeography of South American "endemic" hoses will be discussed below.



cf. *Hippidion* sp. Fig. 7, Table 1.

0 1 2 CM

Referred Specimen. LACM 3363, incomplete left ramus with fragments of three cheek teeth, probably P_3-M_1 (Fig. 7).

Locality and Age. This specimen was collected from LACM locality no. 1245-15 in sediments probably equivalent to the Vallecito Creek I.f. (Downs and White, 1965; Downs, personal communication, 1977). This local fauna occurs in the Matuyama reversed polarity epoch below a normal event that represents either the Réunion¹ or Olduvai. These constraints indicate an Irvingtonian (Late Pliocene to Early Pleistocene) age for the cf. Hippidion specimen that is bracketed by the Gauss-Matuyama boundary at about 2.4 million years ago and either the base of the Réunion event at about 2.1 million years ago or the base of the Olduvai event at about 1.85 million years ago (Lindsay, Johnson, and Opdyke, 1975; Opdyke et al., 1977). Description and Discussion. LACM 3363 is very poorly preserved. The teeth, probably P_3-M_1 , are less hypsodont than contemporary Equus. The dental pattern shows deep ectoflexids in both the premolars and molars, and, therefore, we refer this specimen to Hippidion. The principal importance of LACM 3363 is in the recognition of cf. Hippidion from Irvingtonian sediments of North America.

Fig. 7.

Occlusal view of cf. *Hippidion* sp., LACM 3363, P_3-M_1 , from the Irvingtonian of southern California. Enamel is blackened for contrast. Broken areas are indicated by dashed lines (modified from an illustration prepared by Ms. F. Runyan of the LACM).

American origin. Horses are not found in South America until the Uquian (Late Pliocene to Early Pleistocene), roughly 2 million years ago (Marshall et al., 1977), and their appearance represents dispersal from North America during the opening of the Central American land bridge (Webb, 1976). Reed (1950, p. 76–77), in his discussion of the Milk Creek I.f. of Arizona, states that: "The horses appear to be related to Pliohippus [Dinohippus], and it has been suggested by Dr. R. A. Stirton of the University of California that they may be ancestral to the South American Hippidium [sic] of the Pleistocene." The great "morphological distance" between these North and South American horses has given rise to speculation as to structural and phylogenetic intermediates. Stirton (1940, p. 192) states that: "Upper Pliocene representatives of this group, when found, should display a moderately restricted narial notch in contrast to the extreme observed in Hippidium [sic]." As predicted by Stirton, morphologically intermediate forms are now known from North America as a result of the present report.

Biogeography

The origin of the South American "endemic" horses has been a matter of some interest in the past. Many students of fossil mammals, including Matthew (1924) and Stirton (1940), have recognized that this group was of North

¹The existence, duration, and boundaries of the Réunion event are presently uncertain (see, e.g., Opydke, 1972, and Watkins, 1972).



Table 1.

Tooth measurements (mm) for Hippidion.

| | | | | | Hippidio | n sp., F:A | M 1014 | 39 | | | | | |
|-----|-------|------|-----------------|------|----------|------------|--------|------|------|------|------|-----------------|-----------------|
| | RI3 | RI2 | RI ₁ | LI1 | L 1.2 | LI3 | LC1 | LP2 | LP3 | LP4 | LM1 | LM ₂ | LM ₃ |
| A-P | 11.8@ | 11.0 | 10.6 | 11.3 | 11.2 | 12.8@ | 3.2@ | 31.2 | 28.0 | 27.8 | 24.6 | 27.2 | 28.0 |
| T | 11.9 | 14.6 | 12.5 | 12.4 | 13.8 | 11.5 | 4.3 | 14.0 | 16.4 | 15.9 | 12.4 | 12.0 | 11.4 |

Cf. Hippidion sp., LACM 3363

| | LP ₃ LP ₄ LM ₁ |
|-----|---|
| A-P | 30.2 28.4 27.6@ |
| T | 15.5 17.6 16.9 |

Abbreviation: @ = approximate.

As presently recognized, the one-toed horses include the genera Pliohippus s. 1. (including Astrohippus), Dinohippus, Onohippidium, Hippidion (including Parahipparion), and Equus s. 1. The phylogenetic relationships of these genera have not been dealt with adequately even in the classic studies of Sefve (1912), Osborn (1918), Stirton (1940), and Hoffstetter (1952). In fact, it might be shown that the taxon "one-toed horses" is not a strictly natural, i.e., monophyletic group. Based on the limited sample discussed in this report, we feel that a discussion of the interrelationships of Onohippidium, Hippidion, and other one-toed horses should be deferred to a more comprehensive study. The major significance of the present study is in the biogeography of Onohippidium and Hippidion in light of the specimens described here. The time of differentiation of Onohippidium and Hippidion from their closest relatives has not previously been discussed. It has been implied that diversification obviously occurred either in North America before dispersal southward or in South America after dispersal southward. We conclude that: 1) Clearly differentiated forms of Onohippidium and Hippidion are found in Hemphillian (Late Miocene to Early Pliocene) deposits of North

America. 2) These genera subsequently dispersed to South America apparently during the Pleistocene faunal interchange. 3) Cf. *Hippidion* sp. is also found in Irvingtonian sediments in North America.

Acknowledgments

We thank Dr. Richard H. Tedford and Mrs. S. Marie Skinner of the American Museum of Natural History for their encouragement during this research. Dr. Tedford brought the specimen of cf. Hippidion sp. to our attention and Dr. Theodore Downs of the Los Angeles County Museum of Natural History kindly loaned it for study. Messrs. Grant E. Meyer and David Frailey offered criticisms that improved earlier versions of the manuscript. Messrs. Raymond J. Gooris and William K. Saccoprepared Figures 4 and 5 respectively. Mrs. Brigitte Meshako and Ms. Betsy Dabakis typed portions of the manuscript. MacFadden conducted some of this research during tenure of a faculty fellowship in the Department of Geological Sciences at Columbia University. The University of Florida contributed funds toward the publication of this research.

Literature Cited

Burmeister, Herman. 1875. Die fossilen Pferde der Pampasformation. [No publisher indicated.] Buenos Aires, p. 1–88.

Downs, Theodore and John A. White. 1965. Late Cenozoic vertebrates of the Anza-Borrego Desert Area, Southern California. Amer. Assoc. Adv. Sci., Sect. E, Abs. Pap.: 10–11.

Forstén, Ann-Marie. 1968. Revision of the Palearctic Hipparion. Acta Zool. Fenn. 119: 1-134.

Gray, John E. 1821. On the natural arrangement of vertebrose animals. London Med. Repository Rev. 15: 296–310.

Hesse, Curtis J. 1940. A Pliocene vertebrate fauna from Higgins, Lipscomb County, Texas. Univ. Texas Publ. 3945: 671–698.

Hoffstetter, Robert. 1952. Les mammifères Pleistocènes de la République de l'Équateur. Mém. Soc. Géol. France. 31: 1–391.

Kitts, David B. 1957. A Pliocene vertebrate fauna from Ellis County, Okalhoma. Oklahoma Geol. Surv. Cir. 45: 1–27.

Lindsay, Everett H. and Norman H. Tessman. 1974. Cenozoic vertebrate localities and faunas in Arizona. J. Arizona Acad. Sci. 9: 3–24.

Lindsay, Everett H., Noye M. Johnson, and Neil D. Opdyke. 1975. Preliminary correlation of North American land mammal ages and geomagnetic chronology. *In* Gerald R. Smith and N. E. Frieland [eds.] Studies on Cenozoic paleontology and stratigraphy. Univ. Michigan Mus. Paleontol. 3: 111–119. Linnaeus, Carolus. 1758. Systema naturae per regna tria naturae . . . 10th ed. Laurentii Salvii, Stockholm. Vol. 1, 824 p.

MacFadden, Bruce J. 1977. Magnetic polarity stratigraphy of the Chamita Formation stratotype (Mio-Pliocene) of northcentral New Mexico. Am. J. Sci. 277: 769–800.

Marshall, Larry G., Rosendo Pascual, Garniss H. Curtis, and Robert E. Drake. 1977. South American geochronology: Radiometric time scale for middle to late Tertiary mammal-bearing horizons in Patagonia. Science 195: 1325–1328.

Matthew, William Diller. 1924. Third contribution to the Snake Creek fauna. Bull. Amer. Mus. Nat. Hist. 50: 59–210.

Moreno, F. P. 1891. Onohippidum muñizi. Breve noticia sobre los restos fósiles de un género nuevo de la familia de los Equidae conservadas en el Museo de La Plata. Rev. Mus. La Plata. 2: 65–71.

Opdyke, Neil D. 1972. Paleomagnetism of deep-sea cores. Rev. Geophys. Space Phys. 10: 213–249. **Opdyke, Neil D., Everett H. Lindsay, Noye M. Johnson,** and **Theodore Downs.** 1977. The paleomagnetism and magnetic stratigraphy of the mammal-bearing section of Anza-Borrego State Park, California. Quat. Res. (New York) 7: 316–329.

Osborn, Henry Fairfield. 1918. Equidae of the Oligocene, Miocene, and Pliocene of North America. Iconographic type revision. Mem. Amer. Mus. Nat. Hist., New Ser., 2: 1–326.

Owen, Richard. 1848. Description of teeth and portions of jaws of two extinct anthracotheroid quadrapeds (*Hyopotamus vectianus* and *H. bovinus*) discovered by the Marchioness of Hastings in the Eocene deposits on the N. W. coast of the Isle of Wight, with an attempt to develop Cuvier's idea of the classification of pachyderms by the number of toes. Q. Geol. Soc. London. 4: 17–42.

Reed, C. A. 1950. A preliminary announcement of a new mammalian fossil locality in the Pliocene of Arizona. Plateau Q. Mus. North. Ariz. 22: 75–77.

Sefve, Ivar. 1912. Die fossilen Pferde Südamerikas. Sven. Vet. Akad. Handl. 48: 1–185.

Sheppard, Richard A. and Arthur J. Gude, 3rd. 1972. Big Sandy Formation near Wikieup, Mohave County, Arizona. U.S. Geol. Surv. Bull. 1354-C: 1–10.

Simpson, George Gaylord. 1951. Horses. New York, Oxford Univ. Press. 247 p. Skinner, Morris F. and Beryl E. Taylor. 1967. A revision of the geology and paleontology of the Bijou Hills, South Dakota. Amer. Mus. Novitates. 2300: 1–53. Sondaar, Paul Y. 1971. The Samos Hipparion. K. Nederland Akad. Wet. Ser. B. 74: 417–441.



Stirton, Ruben A. 1940. Phylogeny of North American Equidae. Univ. California Publ. Geol. Sci. 25: 165–198.

——— 1941. Development of characters in horse teeth and the dental nomenclature. J. Mammal. 22: 434–446.

Tedford, Richard H., Theodore Galusha, Morris F. Skinner, Beryl E. Taylor, Robert W. Fields, James Reid Macdonald, Thomas H. Patton, John M. Rensberger, and David P. Whistler. In press. Faunal succession and biochronology of the Arikareean through Hemphillian interval (late Oligocene through late Miocene Epochs), North America. Univ. California Publ. Geol. Sci.

Watkins, Norman D. 1972. Review of the development of the Geomagnetic Polarity Time Scale and discussion of prospects for its finer definition. Bull. Geol. Soc. Amer. 83: 551–574.

Webb, S. David. 1976. Mammalian faunal dynamics of the great American interchange. Paleobiology 2: 220–234.

Unpublished References

Galusha, Theodore. MS. Unpublished Frick field notes. On file at the Department of Vertebrate Paleontology, The American Museum of Natural History, New York. Skinner, Morris F. MS. Unpublished manuscript on equid dental nomenclature. On file at the Department of Vertebrate Paleontology, The American Museum of Natural History, New York.

The Authors

Bruce J. MacFadden. Formerly of: Department of Geology and Geophysics, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut 06520. Present address: Fiorida State Museum, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida 32611.

Morris F. Skinner. Department of Vertebrate

Paleontology, The American Museum of Natural History, New York, New York 10024.